

Bulletin of Islamic Research ISSN (Online): 3031-4526 Received: 15-03-2024, Revised: 15-04-2024 Accepted: 15-05-2024, Published: 19-06-2024 DOI: 10.69526/bir.v2i3.50

Democracy In Al-Qur'an Perspective: Analysis Of Tafsir Maudhu'i Al-Qurthubi & Quraisy Shihab On Verse Ali-Imran 159

R. Adilla Fadila Nasrulloh¹; R. Rafi Ahmad Fansury²; Rahmah

Fauziah³; Asep Abdul Muhyi⁴

Abstract

The Quran teaches principles to uphold unity, brotherhood, equality, and freedom. Democracy, although controversial among Muslim intellectuals, values human rights, participation in decision-making, and equality under the law. In Indonesia, democracy is considered a strong basis for society, where the government must obtain the consent of the majority and ensure that the rights of minorities are respected. These principles should be reflected in the form of a state that is in line with the values of the majority of its people and provides space for dissent. This study aims to discover what democracy is in Islam and how democracy is from the perspective of Tafsir Al-Qurthubi and Tafsir Al-Mishbah. The method used in this research is that this research uses the descriptive method and also uses the maudhu'i interpretation method. The results of this study state that democracy in Islam is taken from Q.S Ali Imran verse 159. In the verse mentioned a fragment of a word also called shu'ara or deliberation which then the word has experienced a development of meaning. The original meaning is bees that drink honey and its meaning after experiencing expansion becomes "everything that can be taken and issued", namely opinions. In the book of Tafsir Al-Qurthubi, the initial part of this verse is interpreted that the Prophet was gentle with those who turned away at the battle of Uhud and was not harsh with them, so Allah explained that he could do that because of His guidance to him. In the book of Tafsir Al-Mishbah, the word syawirhum comes from the word syawara, where the initial meaning of the word is "removing honey from the beehive". Then over time, this meaning developed to include everything that could be taken and issued (including opinions).

Keywords: Qur'an; Democracy; Syawara'; Tafsir.

¹ UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia, Email: <u>adilanashrulloh@gmail.com</u>

² UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia, Email: <u>fansuryrafi@gmail.com</u>

³ UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia, Email: <u>rahmahfauziah802@gmail.com</u>

⁴ UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung, Indonesia, Email: <u>asepabdulmuhyi@gmail.com</u>

Introduction

The main mission of the Quran in society is to provide rules to uphold principles and reduce all forms of fanaticism from groups and groups. With this equation, fellow members of the community can cooperate even though there are many differences among the community. The differences that exist are not intended to show the superiority of each against the other, but rather to recognize each other and uphold the principles of unity[1], brotherhood, equality, and freedom. One plan that was controversial among Muslim intellectuals at the end of the 20th century was democracy. This is because the word democracy is foreign to Muslims. Of course, this is a problem that has not been resolved until now. Democracy comes from the West, of course, and has a different history and view from the Islamic view which is sourced from the Qur'an and Sunnah. Democracy is often defined by respect for human rights, participation in decision-making, and equal rights before the law[2].

Democracy seeks to equalize the status of citizens under the rule of law. Democracy is a strong basis of life in the heart of Indonesian society[3]. One of the applications of democracy is that the ruling group must get approval from the majority group, and then small groups that differ from the majority are guaranteed their rights in society[4]. The consequence of this principle is that if it is used to form a state, it must reflect what is alive, especially the philosophy of life of most of its people. In addition, these principles also provide living space for groups that have differences of opinion[5].

Method

This research uses a descriptive method and the Maudhu'i interpretation method. The Descriptive Analysis/Literature Review Method and the Tafsir Maudhu'i Method are two different methodological approaches used for a specific type of research. The Descriptive Analysis/Literature Review Method provides a comprehensive overview of the research topic through the collection, analysis and interpretation of relevant literature. The steps involve determining the topic, identifying literature sources, gathering information, structuring the literature review, analyzing, and writing the report[6]. Meanwhile, the Maudhu'i Interpretation Method is a specialized approach to interpreting religious texts, especially the Qur'ān[7]. This approach emphasizes the analysis of the meaning of the content and the connection of the text with the historical and social context. The steps involve analyzing language and terms, understanding historical and social contexts, analyzing interrelationships with other contexts[8], and traditional studies, and forming conclusions. References such as the commentaries of Al-Tabarsi and Al-Razi, as well as the book "Tafsir Maudu'i: An Introduction" by Mustafa, can be an important guide for interpreters and students of religion[9].

Result and Discussion

Definition of Democracy

Democracy originated in ancient Greece in the 5th century BC. The word democracy itself consists of two words, namely, "demos" which means "people" and "Kratos/keratin" which means "government". So, it can be concluded that democracy is the government of the people or the government of the people. A famous person named Abraham Lincoln simply described democracy in his speech at Gettysburg in 1863, namely, "Democracy is the government of the people, for the people and of the people[10]." A closer look at the statement reveals that the essence of the statement is "government by the people". Why is that? Because all forms of government come from the people and none of them (the government) comes from non-people[11][12].

Democracy itself provides an understanding that power comes from people. With that understanding, a rule that benefits and protects the rights of the people will be born. For rules that benefit and protect the rights of the people, there needs to be a collective agreement that supports and becomes a basic guide in state life to guarantee and protect the rights of the people. In Islam, democracy is shu'ara which means deliberation[13]. This word has experienced an expansion of meaning. The original meaning was that of bees drinking honey and the meaning after being expanded became "everything that can be taken and issued", namely opinions. And then it is likened to the person who expresses his opinion like a person who is drinking honey[14][15]. People who are expressing their opinions in the deliberation circle will get or produce something sweet, namely consensus.

Verse About Democracy

Q.S Ali Imran Ayat 159

Q.S Ali Imran Ayat 159:

Meaning: "So, by the grace of Allah you (Prophet Muhammad) were gentle with them. Had you been harsh and hard-hearted, they would have stayed away from you. Therefore, forgive them, ask forgiveness for them, and consult with them in all (*important*) *matters*. *Then, when you have made up your mind, put your trust in Allah. Verily, Allah loves those who put their trust in Him*[16]." (Q.S Ali Imran: 159)

Munasabah

This verse is related to verse 160 which reads :

Meaning: "Therefore, let the believers put their trust in Allah alone." (Q.S Ali Imran: 160)

These two verses are connected because at the end of verse 159, namely in the section "فَإِذَا عَزَمُتَ فَتَوَكَّلُ عَلَى ٱللَّهِ" Then, when you have made up your mind, put your trust in Allah..." There is an order to surrender to Allah SWT after exerting various efforts, namely deliberation which is then stated more clearly at the end of verse 160, namely, "وَعَلَى اللَّؤُمِنُوْنَ" ... Therefore, let the believers put their trust in Allah alone[17]". The command to trust is preceded by "determination" so that humans exert all their abilities to achieve their goals. Only after that, they are asked to surrender only to Allah SWT. Because in essence humans are only trying and the matter of determining is the right of Allah SWT[18].

Interpretation Surah Ali-imran On Verse 159

Tafsir Al-Qurthubi

In the book of Tafsir Imam Qurthubi explained "Maa" in the word فَبِمَا a shilah in which there is a taukiid (affirmation) meaning. While according to Ibn Kaisan is maa nakirah which is in majrur position with the cause of 'ba, while $\tilde{\zeta}$ فَمَةِ مَنَ اللهُ لِلْتَ لَهُمْ (fibro back is the badal [19]). The meaning of this verse is that when the Messenger of Allah (may Allah's peace and blessings be upon him) was gentle with those who turned away in the battle of Uhud and did not be harsh with them, Allah explained that he was able to do that because of His guidance to him[20].

The word "لألت" The word "linta" here is taken from the root word al-lin which means "gentle", as opposed to al-khusyunah or harsh. Originally the word lin was intended for material things, but eventually it was used for material things such as morals. Linta means "you are gentle." But this second opinion is far from the truth because if that were the case, the context would be fabima, without the alif[21].

then the word of Allah وَلَوْ كُنْتَ فَظًّا غَلِيْظَ الْقَلْبِ لَانْفَضُوْا مِنْ حَوْلِكَ (If you are harsh) وَلَوْ كُنْتَ فَظًّا غَلِيْظَ الْقَلْبِ لَانْفَضُوْا مِنْ حَوْلِكَ and hard-hearted, they will distance themselves from you), meaning that if you

speak badly and are harsh with them, they will distance themselves from you and leave you. This is understood from the word \hat{J} (lauw) which is translated as (If). This word is used to describe something conditional[22], but the condition cannot exist[23]. If so, when the verse states that if you are harsh and hard-hearted, they will turn away from you, it means that being harsh and hard-hearted does not exist, and since it does not exist, then of course, they will turn away from you will never happen. Word غَائِدْ الْقَابُ (hard-hearted) is an expression for a face that is always sour, insensitive to any wishes, and lacking in affection[24][25].

Tafsir Al-Misbah (Quraisy Shihab)

Firman Allah فَاعْفُ عَنْهُمْ وَاسْتَغْفِرْ لَهُمْ وَسَاوِرْهُمْ فِى الْأَمْرَ (so forgive them, ask forgiveness for them, and deliberate with them in a matter). In Tafsir Al-Mishbah by Quraish Shihab, he explained that the word mile meaning of the word was derived from the word 'syawara' where the initial meaning of the word was "removing honey from the beehive[26]". Then over time, this meaning developed to include everything that could be taken and issued[27]. Honey is something sweet that is produced by bees. Not only is it sweet, it also serves as medicine as well as a source of health and strength. If those who deliberate are likened to bees, disciplined animals, admirable cooperation, never damage wherever they build nests, that is deliberation and that is the nature of those who do it. So it is no wonder that the Prophet SAW likened a believer to a bee[28][29].

Quraish Shihab also explained in his Tafsir, that the main emphasis of this verse is deliberation. This is due to the events that occurred at the battle of Uhud which as we know that the Muslims suffered defeat. This was preceded by deliberation (war tactics) and approved by the majority[30]. However, as we know, the Muslims were defeated in that battle and this result may lead one to conclude that there should be no deliberation if such deliberation leads to failure. Therefore, this verse is understood as a command to deliberate. Any decision taken through deliberation, if the result is a mistake[31], then the mistake is not as great as the decision taken without deliberation and the truth achieved alone is not better than the truth achieved together[32].

In Tafsir Al-Mishbah, there are three characteristics and attitudes that were ordered to the Prophet SAW when deliberating, namely:

 Be gentle, not harsh, and not hard-hearted. The clue to this number one is found in the fragment of the verse that reads لَوْ كُنْتَ فَظًّا عَلِيْظَ مَنْ حَوْلِكَ which means "If you had been stern and harshhearted, they would have stayed away from you[33][34]."

- 2. Apologize and turn over a new leaf. Clue number two is found in the word فَاعْفُ عَنْهُمْ The word "forgiveness" literally means "to erase", so forgiving is to erase all wounds in the heart due to words or actions that others have done to us. In the context of deliberation, forgiveness here is done when there is a difference of opinion between us and others or out of other people's opinions offensive words or speech. If these words are accepted by the heart, in the sense of making us hurt, it will cloud the mind and may cause quarrels[35][36].
- 3. Putting your trust in Allah SWT after deliberation. This third clue is found in the fragment of the verse that reads فَلِذَا عَزَمْتَ فَتَوَكَّلْ عَلَى اللهِ أَسْ which means "Then, when you have made up your mind, put your trust in Allah". In this verse, there is a requirement for the field of deliberation, namely in the word في الأَمْر "in that matter". In terms of context, this verse is understood that the affairs in question are in matters of warfare. Therefore, some scholars limit that the deliberation ordered to the Prophet SAW is only limited to matters of warfare. However, this view is not in line with what the Prophet practiced and is not in line with many verses of the Qur'an[37][38].

Thus, the field of deliberation is societal issues, such as the understanding of this verse[39]. The companions of the Prophet were well aware of this, they never advised on matters that had received guidance from Allah SWT[40].

Conclusion

In Islam, democracy is also called shu'ara, which means deliberation. This word has experienced an expansion of meaning. The initial meaning is bees drinking honey and the meaning after experiencing expansion becomes "everything that can be taken and issued", namely opinions. Then it is likened to the person who expresses his opinion to a person who is drinking honey. The person who is expressing his opinion in the circle of deliberation will get or produce something sweet, namely consensus. In Al-Imran verse 159 mentioned that the author mentions two muffasir who explain the verse, namely the interpretation of Al-Qurthubi and Al-Misbah. In the interpretation of Al-Qurthubi, namely in his interpretation he explains more about the personality of the rosul who is always gentle, namely when the Prophet was gentle with those who turned away at the battle of uhud and did not rude to them[43]. But Tafsir Al-Misbah emphasizes more on the sentence of deliberation that in making decisions it is preferable to deliberate because it minimizes failure, compared to making decisions alone.

Author Contributions

R. Adilla Fadila Nasrulloh: Conceptualization, Methodology, Writing – review & editing, Supervision, Project administration. **R. Rafi Ahmad Fansury**: Methodology, Writing – review & editing, Investigation. **Rahmah Fauzia&Asep Abdul Muhyi**: Conceptualization, Methodology, Writing – review & editing, Investigation.

Acknowledgment

We would like to thank UIN Sunan Gunung Djati Bandung and an anonymous reviewer for providing valuable input on these papers.

Conflict of Interest

"The authors declare no conflicts of interest".

Funding

"This research did not receive any financial support.

Bibliography

- [1] M. Sobirin, "Wacana Teologis Kontra Demokrasi Pancasila: Analisis Sosio-Pragmatis Terhadap Al-Qur'an Tarjamah Tafsiriyah Muhammad Thalib," *Mutawatir*, vol. 10, no. 1, 2020.
- [2] A. Mukrimun, "Application Analysis Study and Implications of Rules 'Al-Ibratu BiUmūmi Al-Lafdzi Lā Bi Khushūshi As-Sabab' In Tafsir Mafātih al-Ghoīb," Bull. Islam. Res., vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 27–28, 2023.
- [3] A. Jadidah, "Konsep Ketahanan Keluarga Dalam Islam," *Maqashid J. Huk. Islam*, vol. 4, no. 2, 2021.
- [4] A. Zayyadi, "PENDEKATAN HERMENEUTIKA AL-QURAN KONTEMPORER NASHR HAMID ABU ZAID," MAGHZA J. Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir, vol. 2, no. 1, 2017.
- [5] E. C. M. Djamil, E. G. Rahayu, and F. Fahreza, "Thoroughly Exploring Secularism in an Islamic Perspective: History, Dynamics, and Interpretation of the Qur' an," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 1–16, 2024.
- [6] N. Nurhasan and S. N. Rohmah, "Analysis of the Comparative Western Democracy, Pancasila Democracy, and the Concept of Shura; Study of the Book Manuscript 'Democracy in Islamic Perspective by Ahmad Sukardja and Ahmad Sudirman Abbas,'" J. Leg. Res., vol. 3, no. 2, 2021.
- [7] K. Uin, S. Utara, and T. Panggabean, "Islamic Defense Action Movement 212 in the Perspective of Muslim," *J. Islam. Stud. Humanit.*, vol. 6, no. 1,

2021.

- [8] S. Syafruddin, Z. Zulheldi, F. Faizin, and M. Mukhrin, "Makna Hizb dalam Al-Qur'an: Mengungkap Pesan Moral Al-Qur'an tentang Politik Identitas," *AL QUDS J. Stud. Alquran dan Hadis*, vol. 6, no. 2, 2022.
- [9] M. S. Ritonga, "Demokrasi dan Penegakan Hukum dalam Wawasan Al-Qur'an," *alashriyyah*, vol. 7, no. 02, 2021.
- [10] D. Noqita, E. S. Q. Solihat, and F. A. At-, "Islam, Radikalisme dan Terorisme Dalam Perspektif Al- Qur' an: Kajian Tafsir Tematik," Bull. Islam. Res., vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 251–264, 2024.
- [11] I. Imronudin, "Pendidikan Inter-Religius Perspektif Al-Qur'an," *Alim* | *J. Islam. Educ.*, vol. 2, no. 2, 2021.
- [12] A. A. Masyhuri, "KONSEP IDEOLOGI POLITIK DALAM AL-QUR'AN," J. Alwatzikhoebillah Kaji. Islam. Pendidikan, Ekon. Hum., vol. 8, no. 2, 2022.
- [13] M. H. Kamali, "Constitutionalism and Democracy: An Islamic Perspective," *ICR J.*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2010.
- [14] E. Righayatsyah and A. A. Muhyi, "Islam dan Hak Asasi Manusia Dalam Perspektif Al- Qur'an: Kajian Tafsir Tematik," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 267–288, 2024.
- [15] M. A. Yusron, "PERKEMBANGAN KAJIAN TEORITIS TAFSIR SOSIAL DI INDONESIA," TAFAKKUR J. Ilmu Al-Qur'an dan Tafsir, vol. 2, no. 2, 2022.
- [16] P. Dewi, R. N. Putri, and A. A. Muhyi, "Islamic Views on Radicalism and Terrorism," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 81–92, 2024.
- [17] Y. Tri Nur Rahmawati, "TINJAUAN SAKRALITAS KEPEMIMPINAN PENDIDIKAN DALAM PERSPEKTIF AL-QUR'AN," CENDEKIA J. Stud. Keislam., vol. 3, no. 1, 2018.
- [18] N. A. Prasanti, P. E. Adila, R. Mughiry, and A. A. Muhyi, "The Correlation between Islam and Globalization According to the Maudhu ' i Interpretation," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 237–250, 2024.
- [19] E. Rahmawati, F. A. Aziz, and G. R. Jannah, "The phenomenon of the Hijab Wrapping Tightly in the Qur'an Sunnah Review and its Comparison with the Veil and Burqa," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 93–112, 2024.
- [20] M. I. Thaib, "Baitul Mal Aceh and Productive Zakat Education for Mustahiq," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 327–342, 2024.
- [21] K. Bakry, "Konsep Syūrā dalam al-Quran," Nukhbatul 'Ulum, vol. 4, no. 1,

2018.

- [22] R. Siregar, S. Nahar, and E. Sahputra, "NILAI-NILAI PENDIDIKAN MULTIKULTURAL (Studi Analisis Tafsir Al-Maraghi)," *AT-TAZAKKI*, vol. 2, no. 2, 2018.
- [23] F. H. Akbar, F. L. Fasha, and F. Abdullah, "Konsep Moderasi Beragama dalam Tinjauan Qur'an Hadis Pendahuluan," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 59–80, 2024.
- [24] N. Isma, N. Holifah, N. F. Amini, and S. N. Rois, "Islam dan Fundamentalisme Dalam Al' Qur'an," Bull. Islam. Res., vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 131–148, 2023.
- [25] A. Irfan, "TELAAH KRITIS TENTANG TEOLOGI PEMBEBASAN DALAM PEMIKIRAN ASGHAR ALI ENGINEER PERSPEKTIF ISLAMIC WOELDVIEW," Tesis, 2012.
- [26] Rohidin, "Perspektif Hukum dan HAM terhadap Eksistensi Aliran Keagamaan di Indonesia," *Pandecta*, vol. 6, no. 1, 2011.
- [27] H. SUTANTO, "PROSES PEMBUMIAN KONSEP TAJDID MUHAMMADIYAH SEBAGAI GERAKAN ISLAM MODERNIS," Dialog, vol. 34, no. 1, 2017.
- [28] A. N. An, F. Arfan, F. D. Marshal, C. Maulana, and N. Fadli, "Metodologi Tafsir Al-Qur'an: Methods of Qur'an Research and Quran Tafseer Research its implications for contemporary Islamic thought," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 33–42, 2024.
- [29] M. HAKIM, "PEMIKIRAN HASAN AL-BANNA TENTANG PENDIDIKAN AKHLAK DALAM METODE PENDIDIKAN AHKLAK," العدد الحا, vol. العدد الحا, no. 3, 2017.
- [30] A. A. Thaba, Islam dan Negara dalam Politik Orde Baru. 1996.
- [31] Z. Abidin, "Tafsir Maudhu'i: Study of the Qur'an on Business, Trade and Economy: Tafsir Maudhu'i: Kajian Al-Qur'an Mengenai Bisnis, Perdagangan Dan Perekonomian," Bull. Islam. Res., vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 57–72, 2023.
- [32] Y. Hardian *et al.*, "Prediksi Jumlah Pendapatan Asli Daerah Kabupaten Boyolali dengan Metode Jaringan Syaraf Tiruan Backpropagation," *Pros.* SNST ke-9 Tahun 2018 Fak. Tek. Univ. Wahid Hasyim 7, vol. 1, no. 2, 2013.
- [33] B. N. Hoir, "Thematic Tafsir Study: Religious Moderation in the Qur'an," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 43–56, 2023.
- [34] N. Damayanti, S. A. Nurazizah, and R. Abdurohman, "The Concept of

Human Rights from The Qur'an Perspective," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 17–32, 2024.

- [35] D. Nurfazri and D. N. Agustin, "Islam dan Demokrasi: Kajian Tafsir Maudhu'i," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 289–310, 2024.
- [36] D. Apriliani, D. Tafa, and F. Munawwar, "Islam dan Globalisasi dalam Kajian Tafsir Maudhu'i," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 217–236, 2024.
- [37] Mahmudulhassan, "Exploring the Essence, Importance, and Distinctive Attributes of Islamic Culture: An In-depth Cultural Analysis," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 311–326, 2024.
- [38] R. Alfi, N. Hasanah, R. Rifkiah, and A. A. Muhyi, "Contemporary Traditions and Challenges: Tafsir Maudhu'i's Study of Islam and Fundamentalism," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 181–198, 2024.
- [39] D. D. Hasanah, D. N. Salsabila, and H. A. Al, "Bagaimana Hubungan Islam dan Liberalisme dalam Perspektif Qur'an ?," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 43–58, 2024.
- [40] A. F. R, "Hermeneutics of Gender : A Comparative Study of Hermeneutical Models Amina Wadud and Farid Esack," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 199–216, 2024.
- [41] S. F. Fuadia, R. Aini, R. M. Soba, and A. A. Muhyi, "The Concept of The State in Islam : A Study of Maudhu'i's Interpretation," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 2, pp. 163–180, 2024.
- [42] D. Sukmawati, G. P. Pratama, and D. Abdullah, "Islam dan Lembaga Negara Pendahuluan Indonesia adalah negara dengan kerangka kelembagaan yang terorganisir Pendekatan dalam konteks ini merujuk pada sudut pandang yang Diskusi dan Pembahasan Pengertian Islam dan Lembaga Negara Dari segi bahasa, lembaga n," Bull. Islam. Res., vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 149–162, 2024.
- [43] Y. Irbah, "Main The Principle Of Inter-Religious Tolerance (A Comparative Study Of The Interpretation Of Surat Al Kafirun Between Hamka And Quraish Shihab," Bull. Islam. Res., vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 20–32, 2023.
- [44] D. Ramdani, D. L. Hilwa, and F. F. Muzani, "Islam dan Pluralisme dalam Perspektif Al- Qur'an : Kajian Tafsir Tematik," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 2, no. 1, pp. 113–130, 2024.
- [45] F. Muhammad, "The Ethics Of Communication To Parents In Surah Maryam Ayat 42-48 (Study On Kitab Tafsir Al-Taysir By Firanda Andirja," *Bull. Islam. Res.*, vol. 1, no. 1, pp. 33–42, 2023.